

# THE EARLY YEARS OF THE ASSOCIATION OF UNIVERSITY TEACHERS OF ACCOUNTING: 1947–1959

# STEPHEN A. ZEFF Rice University

The first organization of accounting academics in the UK, the Association of University Teachers of Accounting, was launched in 1947. Today it is known as the British Accounting Association. The Association was initially an enterprise of teachers in English and Welsh universities. It was founded at a time when impetus was being given to the study of accounting in their universities, and the first full-time accounting chairs were established in Britain. It was also a period in which serious efforts were made to stimulate accounting research.

The paper will begin with a discussion of the changing climate in accounting education and research, and is followed by a history of the Association's first 12 years. © 1997 Academic Press Limited

# EVOLUTION OF UK ACADEMIC ACCOUNTING TO 1947

#### Early Accounting Chairs

Prior to 1947, academic accounting in the UK was dominated by practical men with an interest in accounting education, who took part-time positions in the universities. All of the chair holders in England and Scotland during this period served on a part-time basis. Some, such as L. R. Dicksee, S. S. Dawson and F. R. M. de Paula, were progressive thinkers and made important contributions to the literature (see Brief, 1980; Kitchen & Parker,

Correspondence should be addressed to: Professor S. A. Zeff, Jesse H. Jones Graduate School of Administration - MS 531, Rice University, Houston, TX 77005-1892, USA.

The author owes a large debt of gratitude to the late David Solomons, who graciously contributed his files relating to his involvement in the Association of University Teachers of Accounting (AUTA) during the period 1947–1959. Without these files, the history of the AUTA prior to 1960 could not have been written. The author is also grateful to Lou Goldberg for furnishing a copy of Issue No. 2 of the AUTA Newsletter and for comments on an earlier draft, to Keith Maunders for providing a large file of AUTA correspondence, to Richard Macve for his diligent searches in the LSE library, and to Will Baxter, Harold Edey, Vyvyan Cornwell, Steve Walker, Tom Lee, Michael Mumford, Bob Parker, Christopher Napier, Michael Bromwich, David Flint and Dick Edwards, as well as the participants in the 8th Annual ABFH Conference, held at the Cardiff Business School on 18–19 September 1996, for their comments on earlier drafts. This paper is dedicated to the memory of David Solomons (1912–1995).

1980; Parker & Zeff, 1996). A full-time chair, initially combining accountancy with commerce, was installed at University College Galway in 1914 and, with the addition of economics, continued in existence for 55 years.

On 1 October 1902, Lawrence R. Dicksee took up a post as Professor of Accounting, part-time, in the University of Birmingham, the first such appointment in a UK university.<sup>1</sup> Dicksee was already well known for his pioneering work, *Auditing: A Practical Manual for Auditors*, first published in 1892, as well as for other books and articles that flowed from his prolific pen. He was the senior partner in the London firm of Sellars, Dicksee & Co. Also, in 1902, he began lecturing at the London School of Economics (thus becoming the first accounting lecturer at LSE), and, in 1906, he resigned the Birmingham Chair 'to spend more time on a post concerned with business training of Army officers, at the LSE' (Craner & Jones, 1995).<sup>2</sup> He continued to lecture at LSE for the next 25 years, always in a part-time capacity.

In 1907, Sidney S. Dawson, a Liverpool practitioner, succeeded to the Birmingham Chair. Dawson, also a frequent contributor to the literature, was best known as compiler of *The Accountant's Compendium*, published in 1898. After 3 years, he resigned the chair 'owing to the pressure of professional engagements' (Craner & Jones, 1995; 1996, p. 8). At the time of their respective appointments, both Dicksee and Dawson were fellows of The Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales (ICAEW).

Following two incumbencies of such short duration, held by professionals practising in other cities, the University turned to a scion of one of Birmingham's prominent families, Charles E. Martineau, an export merchant. He occupied the Chair as a part-timer from 1910 until his retirement in 1931. A graduate of Cambridge and a member of ICAEW,<sup>3</sup> Martineau was the most obscure of the chair holders in England prior to 1947. He is not credited with any publications in the Accountants' Index. Upon Martineau's retirement, the Birmingham Chair was converted to a full-time Readership in Accounting and Administration, to which Donald Cousins was appointed. Cousins continued in the readership until 1947, when it was reinstated as a chair. From 1906 onward, it had been expected that the Chair holder would emphasize the user's perspective, as it was not anticipated that Bachelor of Commerce students would, in the normal course, intend to become professional accountants. This expectation was extended to the readership as well. During his tenure, Cousins wrote introductory texts on bookkeeping, costing and general business finance, which apparently also found favour with a wider commercial audience (Craner & Jones, 1995; 1996).

In the University of London, Dicksee became Reader in Accountancy in 1913, and, somewhat more than a year later, was appointed to the personal chair of Professor of Accounting and Business Organisation, the first accounting chair in the university.<sup>4</sup> Both appointments were on a part-time

basis. In 1920, he was appointed the inaugural Sir Ernest Cassel Professor of Accountancy and Business Methods, part-time, tenable at LSE.<sup>5</sup> He became *emeritus* in 1926, although he continued to lecture from time to time. Dicksee was immediately succeeded in the part-time chair by F. R. M. de Paula, a fellow of the ICAEW and a partner in a London practice. Prior to accepting the chair, de Paula had been a part-time lecturer for some years at LSE and then became Reader in Accounting and Business Organization, part-time, when the readership was instituted in 1924 (Kitchen & Parker, 1980, pp. 60–61, pp. 85–86).<sup>6</sup> De Paula resigned both the Chair and his partnership at the end of 1929 to become chief accountant, and later controller, of Dunlop Rubber Company. Following de Paula's departure, LSE went without a chair in accounting until after the war. As de Paula himself wrote in 1933, 'when I retired at the end of 1929 this chair was utilized for another purpose and therefore there is no such chair of accountancy'.<sup>7</sup>

In Scotland, part-time professors of accounting were first appointed in the University of Edinburgh in 1919, and in the University of Glasgow in 1926. The Council of The Society of Accountants in Edinburgh (Edinburgh Society), led by Richard Brown, the Society's secretary (who died in 1918), promoted the Edinburgh Chair and did much to secure its financing (Lee, 1996, pp. 192–194). T. P. Laird, an accountancy practitioner and a frequent contributor to The Accountants' Magazine, became the inaugural Professor of Accounting and Business Method in the University of Edinburgh. An acknowledged expert on trust accounting, he served until his death in 1927, at which time he was president-elect of the Edinburgh Society (Lee, 1983). Laird was succeeded in the same year by William Annan, who held the Chair until 1943, a year following normal retirement age. Annan, also a practitioner, often contributed to The Accountants' Magazine and was President of the Edinburgh Society from 1939 to 1942, thus becoming the first occupant of a university chair in Britain to serve as president of an accountancy body.<sup>8</sup> A. G. Murray filled the Edinburgh Chair from 1945 until his death in 1957. A practitioner, Murray is best known for being joint editor of The Accountants' Magazine from 1923 to 1930, and Editor from 1930 to 1952 (Lee, 1983; Walker, 1994, pp. 89-90).

In 1926, John Loudon, a partner in a Glasgow firm, became the first Johnstone Smith Professor of Accountancy in the University of Glasgow, the Chair having been endowed the previous year with a gift of £20,000 by David Johnstone Smith, the immediate past President of The Institute of Accountants and Actuaries in Glasgow (Flint, 1978).<sup>9</sup> Loudon served until 1938, when he was succeeded in the Chair by Ian W. Macdonald, a practitioner who became a leading banker following the war. Macdonald remained in the Chair until 1950 (A History of The Chartered Accountants of Scotland, 1954, p. 171). While both Loudon and Macdonald published several articles during their respective tenures, neither was an author of note.

At University College Galway, Bernard Francis Shields, M.A., who had previously been in business and engaged in commercial instruction, was appointed, at the age of 30, the first Professor of Commerce and Accountancy in October 1914.<sup>10</sup> This was the earliest full-time chair in a UK university with Accountancy or Accounting in its title. In 1916, the title of the Chair was broadened to Economics, Commerce and Accountancy, which continued in effect until 1969, when the Chair was abolished. In 1918, Shields resigned to become Professor of Commerce at University College Dublin, where he remained until his retirement in 1951. Francis McBryan, B.A., H.Dip. in Ed., who had been a commercial teacher in secondary schools, thereupon succeeded to the Galway Chair, and remained in post until his retirement in 1952. Neither Shields nor McBryan was a qualified accountant, and neither published any works on accountancy.<sup>11</sup>

In 1926, *The Financial Times* surveyed accountancy appointments in UK and overseas universities. After noting the existence of chairs or lectureships in Birmingham, London, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Liverpool, Manchester, Durham and Aberdeen Universities (and pointing out that accountancy was coupled with business methods in the chair appointments at London and Edinburgh), the newspaper raised a question about the other universities:

'This [enumeration] leaves a considerable proportion of our Universities about ten—that make no special teaching provision in [accountancy]—so very important to modern commerce and industrialism. One is hardly surprised at Oxford and Cambridge, but that Bristol, Leeds, Sheffield, Nottingham and Reading should all be in the same boat is rather astonishing.'<sup>12</sup>

Reviewing the positions in Canada, Australia, New Zealand, South Africa and Hong Kong, *The Financial Times* concluded: 'In comparison with Great Britain, the Universities of the newer world of the Colonies exhibit a much keener appreciation of the value of accountancy in the educated business life of today.<sup>13</sup>

#### Early Institutional Efforts to Foster Research

In 1935, The Society of Incorporated Accountants and Auditors established a research committee whose work 'should include, in the first instance, arrangement for the publication of monographs on professional subjects, for the formation of Research Groups, and special educational work as regards the technique of the profession'.<sup>14</sup> It was not one of the formal committees of the Society's Council, suggesting that its very creation was thought by some to be a radical step. A. A. Garrett, the Society's long-time secretary and its historian, claimed that 'in the United Kingdom and Ireland—and probably in the British dominions—it was the first Research Committee in the accountancy profession' (1961, p. 197). Although Garrett acknowledged that the American Institute of Accountants had previously undertaken research work, the Society may well have been the first professional accountancy body in the English-speaking world to include 'research' in a committee title. At the time, the ICAEW's Council, dominated by conservative practitioners, would not have countenanced a committee with such a title and charge. It was not until 1949 that the ICAEW finally allowed 'research' to appear in a committee title, and even then, not without some trepidation (Zeff, 1972, pp. 13–14).

The output of the Society's research committee was modest in the 1930s, but its pace accelerated in the 1940s and 1950s, consisting primarily of books written by F. Sewell Bray and the sponsorship of an academic journal, *Accounting Research*, which was jointly edited by Bray and Leo T. Little from 1948 to 1958 (see Solomons & Zeff, 1996).<sup>15</sup> In 1952, the Society created the Stamp–Martin Chair of Accounting, tenable, not in a university, but at Incorporated Accountants' Hall, the Society's head office.<sup>16</sup> Bray, a London practitioner who was a research fellow in the department of applied economics at Cambridge University, was the sole occupant of the Chair until its discontinuance in 1957, upon the integration of the Society into the three chartered institutes in the British Isles.

In 1936, the Accounting Research Association (ARA) was formed, mainly through the efforts of Ronald S. (later Sir Ronald) Edwards, a lecturer at LSE, and Cosmo Gordon, the librarian of the ICAEW.<sup>17</sup> Eric Hay Davison (an ICAEW member in industry), several practitioners, and the editor of *The Accountant* were also active in the ARA.<sup>20</sup> Davison did much to encourage accountants to join the group. Its objects were:

- (1) To promote research into the history and development of accounting.
- (2) To discover, in particular, how economic, social and legal changes have affected the development of methods of accounting.
- (3) To examine the present position of accounting theory and practice with the object of formulating basic principles' (Bircher, 1991, p. 158, p. 160).

The speaker at the ARA's inaugural meeting on 14 December 1936, at which over 100 people were present, was Sir Josiah (later Lord) Stamp, GCB, GBE, DSc(Econ.). In a celebrated speech in 1921 to the Society, Sir Josiah had challenged accountants to become researchers and thus join in 'the quest for truth and the advance of knowledge' (Stamp, 1921, p. 507; Garrett, 1961, pp. 125–128). In his talk to the ARA, he reiterated some of the arguments he had made 15 years before, and suggested some fruitful lines of research.<sup>19</sup>

The ARA was launched with optimism that a vehicle had finally been found for the encouragement and dissemination of scholarly research into the history, development and present state of accounting, unconstrained by the rigid boundaries of established practice. The ICAEW officially ignored the ARA, but the young organization succeeded in publishing a series of papers, reprints and book reviews, which were issued as supplements to *The Accountant* or were put out separately by Gee and Co., then the leading UK publisher of books on accountancy and kindred subjects, as well as proprietor of *The Accountant*. Edwards recalled that 'Our reviews were critical and analytical and regarded, therefore, as rather shocking'.<sup>20</sup>

The ARA's membership reached a high of 239, yet the organization ceased functioning by 1941. The war took its toll. Once peace was restored, it was evident that most of the idealistic founders had either lost their ardour or had gone off into other pursuits. Ronald Edwards, the driving force during ARA's short life, had become interested in the interplay between engineering and economics (Zeff, 1972, pp. 2–3; Bircher, 1991, pp. 156–183).<sup>21</sup>

#### LSE from the 1930s to 1947

Harold Edey (1974, pp. 1–2) has remarked that the course syllabuses prior to the 1930s at LSE contained 'a greater dose of the "impedimenta of subordinate detail" than would now be thought desirable' and that the published work of Dicksee and de Paula 'leaned, as one would expect in a young subject, more towards clear exposition of practice than critical analysis'. (Dicksee and de Paula were, however, leading figures in the improvement of practice.) 'The period from the thirties to the present day', he added, 'saw the study of the subject in the School more firmly anchored to the bedrock of economic theory'.<sup>22</sup>

In the 1930s, Ronald Edwards, Ronald Coase and Ronald Fowler—the 'three Ronalds', as they have been called—had the good fortune to come under the spell of an inspiring teacher, Professor Arnold Plant. In turn, Plant was fortunate to have three such talented disciples. He recruited them to his staff at LSE, and the three assistant lecturers wrote a number of scholarly articles on accounting history, accounting theory and costing in the latter 1930s. Edwards and Coase published much of their work in *The Accountant*, not a learned journal, but a weekly practitioner magazine whose editor, Miss V. M. Snelling, was courageous not only in supporting the ARA but also in publishing lengthy, theoretical articles (Baxter, 1991, p. 139).

The most memorable of Edwards' papers on accounting was a 13-part article in 1938 on 'The Nature and Measurement of Income'. In the article, he drew extensively on the work of economists and accounting theorists, and seemed to be especially influenced by the major treatises of Professors John B. Canning (1929) and James C. Bonbright (1937). He propounded a future-oriented, increased-net-worth concept of income that provoked expressions of outrage from Stanley W. Rowland, a practitioner and a part-time lecturer in Edwards' own department (Bircher, 1991, pp.178–180; Parker & Zeff, 1996).<sup>23</sup> Edwards' 1938 article nonetheless had a large impact on W. T. Baxter, who was then a full-time Professor of Accounting in the University of Cape Town (Baxter, 1978, pp. 16–17 of Preface), and eventually also on David Solomons, who joined the department as a part-time

lecturer in 1946 (converted to full-time in 1947), having been a student of Plant's during his undergraduate days at LSE (Solomons, 1984, vol. 1, p. xv). When Solomons joined the LSE faculty, he found a mentor in Edwards, and Solomons' writings on asset valuation in the 1960s may be traced directly to Edwards' influence (Zeff, 1995).

In several of their published papers during that period, Edwards and Coase applied economic reasoning to cost analysis, thus defining the LSE's approach to the subject and setting the stage for a series of later LSE contributions in the area (Gould, 1974; Arnold & Scapens, 1981; Coase, 1982; Coase 1990; Baxter, 1991).

On 1 May 1947, LSE appointed Baxter as its first full-time Professor of Accounting, which was also the first full-time accounting chair in Britain. Apparently by coincidence, on 1 October 1947, the University of Birmingham also instituted a full-time chair in Accounting and Administration, and elevated Donald Cousins, the University's full-time Reader in Accounting and Administration since 1931, to the post (Craner & Jones, 1995).<sup>24</sup>

In his inaugural lecture, Baxter surveyed the accounting scene in Britain:

"While accounting managed to win its way into some British universities several decades since, its place has so far been small and uncertain. Mine is, I think, the first full-time chair to be created in Britain; and many universities are only this year appointing their first full-time—or even part-time—instructors ...' (Baxter, 1948, p. 181).

"... the most remarkable thing about accounting as a field of study is that it is not so much a subject by itself as a synthesis of other subjects' (p. 181).

'The lack of any liaison between accounting and economic theory is so marked and so astonishing as to call for a whole lecture to itself. Each subject has grown up in serene indifference to the other, although both try to solve much the same problems, and in certain places the degrees of overlapping is remarkable.' (p. 182)

Baxter cited the works of two economists (Canning and Bonbright) and no accounting academics.

#### The Universities and the Accountancy Profession

In September 1944, the McNair Committee, known formally as the Joint Committee Representing the Universities and the Accountancy Profession, rendered a momentous report.<sup>25</sup> Composed of representatives of the Universities and University Colleges, the ICAEW, the Society and The Association of Certified and Corporate Accountants, the committee (which was chaired by Sir Arnold McNair, Vice-Chancellor of the University of Liverpool) recommended a 'Universities scheme', under which co-operating

universities in England and Wales would introduce new options in accountancy, law, a modern foreign language and government in the curriculum for their degrees offered in economics and commerce. In return, the professional bodies would undertake to exempt 'scheme' graduates from their Intermediate examinations (see Solomons & Berridge, 1974, pp. 37–40). The committee continued in existence as the Joint Standing Committee of the Universities and the Accountancy Profession, and conferences to discuss the evolution of its work were held at Easter during odd-numbered years, beginning in April 1947.<sup>26</sup> In this setting, accounting academics were brought into closer contact with leading members of the accountancy bodies who were sympathetic with the role that universities might play in preparation for entry into the profession.<sup>27</sup>

One of the members of the Joint Committee, Sir Alexander Carr-Saunders, who was Director of LSE and co-author of an important book on the professions (1933), was invited by the Minister of Education in 1946 to chair a special committee 'To consider the provision which should be made for education for commerce and for the professions relating to it, and the respective contributions to be made thereto by universities and by colleges and departments of commerce in England and Wales'.<sup>28</sup> The committee's report, submitted in 1949, contained, inter alia, the suggestion that 'parttime day courses, possibly on the "sandwich" principle, giving preparation for the intermediate and final examinations of the three main bodies of accountants, should be organised by the colleges of commerce and the major technical colleges on a regional basis and in conjunction with the accountancy bodies'.<sup>29</sup> The Accountant greeted the report with 'astonishment',<sup>30</sup> and the Council of the ICAEW, in a 50-page rejoinder, declared that 'the recommendations of the Carr-Saunders Committee are wholly inappropriate for persons wishing to become members of the Institute ... [and] would undermine the Institute's whole system of training under articles' (Solomons & Berridge, 1974, p. 24).<sup>31</sup>

The situation in Scotland was much different than in England and Wales. A 'distinctive feature of the Scottish profession from the outset was its close links with the universities. Part-time attendance at university classes in law was compulsory from the outset for non-graduate apprentices, and attendance at classes in economics and accountancy on a part-time basis was required for many years ...' (Solomons & Berridge, 1974, p. 17).<sup>32</sup> Moreover, the accountancy bodies in Edinburgh and Glasgow evinced an almost paternal interest in the accounting chairs founded in 1919 and 1926 in the two universities, and they played a role in identifying candidates when vacancies arose. The chairs in the two Scottish universities were not allowed to lapse. In England and Wales, by contrast, there was no protest from the accountancy bodies when, during the period from 1931 to 1947, there were no professors of accounting in Birmingham and London.<sup>33</sup>

#### AUTA 1947-1959

# ACADEMIC ACCOUNTING BODIES IN OTHER COUNTRIES

Formation of the Association of University Teachers of Accounting was preceded by associations of accounting academics in two other countries: the United States and Japan. The oldest organization of accounting academics is the American Accounting Association (AAA), which was founded in 1916 as the American Association of University Instructors in Accounting. The AAA adopted its present name in 1935, its intention being to broaden the scope of the Association to include the encouragement and sponsorship of research and the development of accounting principles and standards.<sup>34</sup>

The growth of business schools in US universities during the first three decades of the century created a demand for accounting educators, and the number of accounting academics burgeoned. Accounting textbooks proliferated, and articles written by academics filled the practitioner journals and The Accounting Review, the AAA's quarterly journal launched in 1926. In 1936, the AAA's executive committee published its views on the accounting principles underlying corporate financial reports, in order to provide the recently established Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) with guidance on proper practice, an initiative not altogether welcomed by the practitioner community (see Zeff, 1966, pp. 45-49). In 1940, the AAA collaborated with the American Institute of Accountants, the practitioners' organization, in the distribution to members of the influential monograph, An Introduction to Corporate Accounting Standards, by W. A. Paton and A. C. Littleton. In the monograph, the authors presented an elegant defence of historical cost accounting, which, with the SEC's strong support for historical cost accounting, effectively precluded any serious consideration of other valuation bases in corporate financial reporting until the inflationary decade of the 1970s. The AAA has also been active on a wide range of matters relating to accounting education.

In 1937, the Japan Accounting Association (JAA) was founded 'as a purely academic association' along lines similar to the AAA ('The Japan Accounting Association', 1993). British accounting academics were, however, unlikely to have known of the JAA.

Hence, there were two precedents when, in 1947, British accounting academics undertook to form an organization.

### INAUGURAL MEETING OF THE ASSOCIATION

The Association of University Teachers of Accounting held its inaugural meeting at the London School of Economics on 22/23 December 1947.<sup>35</sup> In attendance were 13 teachers representing the following universities:

Birmingham:

Prof. Donald Cousins, BCom, ACA Mr E. J. Newman, BA, ACA

S. A. ZEFF
Mr Brian Magee, BCom, ACA
Mr Charles Magee, BCom, ACA
Mr Albert Bell, FCA
Dr L. M. Lachmann, Dr rer. pol., MSc(Econ.)
Mr A. McCarmick, ACA
Mrs Bramwell McCombe, MA, BCom
Prof. W. T. Baxter, BCom, CA
Mr D. Solomons, BCom, ACA
Mr G. W. Murphy, BA(Com.), FCA
Mr Frank Downing, FCA
Mr C. A. Smith, LLM, FCA

Cousins proposed, and it was unanimously accepted, that Baxter occupy the chair during the meeting.

It was reported in the Minutes that Cousins and Baxter

'had decided to convene the conference as a result of discussions which they had had following on the conference, which was held at Oxford in April 1947, between representatives of the universities and the accountancy profession. They had in mind the formation of an association which would act as a link between the teachers of accounting within the universities and the professional accountancy bodies. The Association should have a simple constitution and could perform a number of very useful functions, including the holding of an annual conference, the circulation of a periodical bulletin for the exchange of information between members, promotion of research work in accounting, and possibly cooperation in the work of the professional journals.<sup>336</sup>

It was resolved to adopt the name of The Association of University Teachers of Accounting (patterned after the Association of University Teachers of Economics, AUTE) and that the officers shall consist of a president, a chairman and a secretary, and 'that there shall in addition be a committee of three members'.<sup>37</sup> The object of the Association, it was agreed, 'shall be the promotion of the study and teaching of accounting, especially within the universities'. The membership was to be restricted to 'teachers of accounting and allied subjects in universities or university colleges in the British Isles, and to such other persons as may be elected by the Association to be honorary members thereof'. The annual subscription was set at 10s 6d, and the following executive officers were chosen:

Chairman:	Prof. Donald Cousins
Secretary:	Mr David Solomons
Committee:	Prof. W. T. Baxter
	Mrs Bramwell McCombe
	Mr Brian Magee

It was resolved that Lord Eustace Percy, Vice-chancellor of the University of Durham and Chairman of the Joint Standing Committee of the Universities and the Accountancy Profession, should be invited to become President of the Association, and he subsequently accepted (although he never attended an Association conference).

Baxter agreed to serve as Editor of a periodic newsletter.

In order to avoid a 'clash' with the annual conferences of the AUTE, which were held during January, it was decided to hold the next conference during the Easter vacation in 1949, and Cousins' invitation that the conference be held in Birmingham was accepted.

It was mentioned in the minutes that invitations to the inaugural meeting 'had been sent only to those universities and university colleges in England and Wales which were at present participating in the joint scheme with the professional accountancy bodies'. The Committee:

'was instructed to investigate the position of the teaching of accounting in the universities of Scotland, Northern Ireland and Eire, with a view to inviting the university teachers of accounting in those countries to join the Association, if it should be found that there was sufficient similarity between the work done in the universities of England and Wales and in those of the other parts of the British Isles to make such a step desirable.<sup>38</sup>

A table was presented which gave the number of students receiving tuition in accounting at the 10 universities represented in the meeting. There were 203 specialist students (i.e. 'those students taking special courses in accounting designed to give exemption from the intermediate examinations of the professional bodies') and 502 non-specialist students, the largest number of the latter being at London and Manchester. In a report of the meeting in *The Accountant*, Solomons wrote, 'Compared with similar figures for the United States, these numbers are minute. But they represent a solid achievement of the last 3 years, and real progress is now being made'.<sup>39</sup> Some regret was expressed at the meeting that 'the absence of honours degrees in accounting (which apparently extends to all universities except London and Birmingham)—sometimes tended to discourage outstanding students from taking up the subject'.

The tension between the universities and conservative members of the profession led to a comment that some of the latter 'had shown some reluctance to accept articled clerks who intended to spend the first 3 years of their articles at the university'.

On the subject of teaching materials, it was noted that:

'A great deal of dissatisfaction was expressed with the text books at present available. Most of the English standard works were regarded as too "tabloid" to be suitable for university students, that they were unduly dogmatic, and did not encourage independent thought. They also tended to divorce study of accounting from the student's other studies, especially by ignoring the work of economists.<sup>40</sup>

Discussion was also devoted to the content of examinations and to contacts between the universities and industry, commerce and the professions.

On the subject of research and book reviews, it was observed that the Accounting Research Association, 'which had done valuable work before the war', was 'in a state of suspended animation' and there was 'no prospect of the former officers of the ARA taking the initiative in reviving its work, and such initiative might therefore well come from the new Association'. Solomons reported that Sewell Bray 'had informed him of the steps already taken to produce a new journal to be known as "Accounting Research". This was being financed by the Society of Incorporated Accountants and Auditors, but would not otherwise be a specifically Society publication'. It was decided that 'the officers of the Association should get in contact with Mr. Bray, and with the [former] officers of the A.R.A. with a view to exploring the possibilities of co-operation between the three bodies'.<sup>41</sup>

Following the meeting, an inaugural dinner was given by LSE for the university representatives, at which the following were also in attendance: Sir Harold Barton, Governor of LSE; Donald V. House, of the ICAEW; Sewell Bray, representing the Society of Incorporated Accountants and Auditors; F. G. Wiseman, of the Association of Certified and Corporate Accountants (ACCA); Derek du Pré, Editor of *The Accountant*; and Ronald S. Edwards, of LSE.<sup>42</sup>

# COUSINS AND SOLOMONS COMMENT ON THE IMPORTANCE OF RESEARCH

At the meeting of the Committee on 14 July 1948, the question of teaching *vs* research arose. Mrs. McCombe had submitted an agenda paper on 'the possibilities of co-operation in accounting research between the Association and the professional accounting bodies'. Cousins, who was not himself a researcher, interposed that:

'the time was not ripe for this work as university departments of accounting had not yet developed any settled policy in connection with the content of undergraduate courses and examinations and that the pressure of work on teachers left little time for outside activity of the kind proposed. There was no magic in the word "research" and co-operation between the universities and the accounting bodies might be allowed to grow naturally out of the published research work done as part of the universities' [normal activities]'.

Solomons, however, 'drew attention to the fact that virtually no accounting research of any kind had yet been done by the universities and that the first duty of members of the Association was to produce results themselves rather than to discuss the organisation of research work by other people'.<sup>43</sup> Baxter was reported in the Minutes as concurring in this view.

To what degree did the members of university accounting departments actually publish research from 1948 to the end of the 1950s? In the nine volumes of *Accounting Research* between 1948 and 1958, only 10 of the approximately 180 articles were authored or co-authored by accounting academics in UK universities, all but one of whom were at LSE: Baxter, Harold Edey, Solomons and Jack Kitchen. No article by an accounting academic at a UK university appeared in *The Accounting Review* from 1948 to 1959.<sup>44</sup> To the degree that such research was published, it most likely appeared in the professional accountancy journals or in journals in neighbouring fields.

#### THE NEWSLETTER APPEARS

The first number of the Association's Newsletter, edited by Baxter, was issued in July 1948. It ran seven single-spaced, typescript pages, of which two pages consisted of news from university departments of accounting and a further two pages were given over to a list of suggested works for inclusion in a university library of accounting. The Secretary reported that membership invitations had been sent to the three Scottish universities, and that 'Edinburgh, led by Professor Murray, is joining in strength . . .'. Owing to expressions of interest in the Association received from Canada, South Africa, New Zealand, India and Israel, the Committee decided to set up a special class of membership, whose holders would be known as corresponding members. Solomons also reported that honorary membership had been conferred on F. R. M. de Paula, OBE, FCA, 'in recognition of his past and present services to the teaching of accounting', and on F. Sewell Bray, FCA, FSAA, 'by virtue of his position as Nuffield Research Fellow in the Department of Applied Economics at Cambridge'.

At the conclusion of his Secretary's report, Solomons wrote, 'At this early stage in the Association's history, it is relatively easy to expand membership—we are ploughing virgin soil. The next twelve months will provide the answer to a more important question—is the Association well adapted to do a really important job of work?' At the first annual conference, by then scheduled for Birmingham during the weekend of 23–25 September 1949 (instead of at Easter, evidently to avoid a conflict with the second conference of the Joint Standing Committee of the Universities and the Accountancy Profession), he said, 'members will have an opportunity to pronounce their own verdict on this question ...'

#### BAXTER PROPOSES PUBLICATION OF TEACHING MATERIALS

At the meeting of the Committee on 9 December 1948, Baxter:

16

'put forward a proposal that the Association should make itself responsible for two or three volumes which would bring together, for the benefit of students, material of a high quality already published in periodicals and in other forms which prevented them from being readily available to students. He envisaged that the first volume might cover general accounting, and the second volume cost accounting. The National Joint Committee had considered the proposal earlier that day but had decided that it was not itself the appropriate body to handle this matter. After discussion it was agreed that the Association should sponsor these publications and that consideration should be given to the addition of a third volume on trust accounting. Professor Baxter and the Secretary undertook to circularise members asking for suggestions as to the contents of the volumes.<sup>445</sup>

This action led to the publication in 1950 of Baxter's pioneering reader, *Studies in Accounting*, which was 'Edited on behalf of the Association of University Teachers of Accounting'. The publisher, Sweet & Maxwell, presented a copy to each member of the Association. Two years later, Sweet & Maxwell published Solomons' equally celebrated reader, *Studies in Costing*, which was likewise edited on behalf of the Association. In view of the higher price of this second volume (35s for Solomons vs 23s 6d for Baxter), as well as the increase in the number of members, the publisher was prepared to offer each member a concessional price of 22s. The Committee, however, decided that the funds of the Association made it possible to cover the cost of providing a copy of Solomons' book to 'all members who pay their 1953 subscription (10s. 6d)',<sup>46</sup> which had been unchanged since the founding of the Association.

### THE SECOND NEWSLETTER

Issue No. 2 of the Association's Newsletter was distributed in July 1949, and ran to 10 pages. It began with the Chairman's Foreword, by Donald Cousins, and the Secretary's report, in which Solomons disclosed that the Association's membership had risen over the year from 17 to 26 full members, including six in Scotland.

A report published in June gave testimony to the small number of accountancy teachers in England and Wales who might be tapped for membership: 29 (apart from special lecturers), of whom only seven were full-time.<sup>47</sup> The distribution by university was as follows:

AUTA 1947-1959

	Full-time	Part-time
Birmingham	1	1
Bristol	0	2
Durham (Newcastle)	1	0
Hull	0	1
Leeds	0	3
Liverpool	1	0
London	2	8
Manchester	1	2
Nottingham	0	1
Sheffield	1	1
Southampton	0	2
Wales	0	1

The dominance of the University of London is evident, representing more than one-third of the total.

In the Newsletter, three signed book reviews were followed by reports from Australia and New Zealand, submitted by Louis Goldberg and W. G. (later Sir William) Rodger, respectively.

The Newsletter closed with a belated note on the death in December 1945 of Henry Rand Hatfield. The Editor wrote that 'Professor Hatfield is probably better known in this country than any other American writer on accounting. His works are characterised not only by a rare simplicity and penetration, but also by frequent glimpses of humour', and then proceeded to give an example of the latter. It was a footnote in Hatfield's *Accounting—Its Principles and Problems* (1927, p. 460) in the section on the Statement of Sources and Disposition of Funds, in which he commented on the clumsiness of this title:

'Professor [William Morse] Cole in the first edition of his *Accounts* uses the title "Where–Got–Gone" Statement, but this has apparently been abandoned even by its author. It is a source of regret that a colorful term introduced into the drab literature of accounting should have fallen into disuse. But it hardly seems the function of this treatise to serve as an asylum for a foundling abandoned by its progenitor.'

# THE 1949 CONFERENCE

On the weekend of 23–26 September 1949, 21 months after the founding of the Association, its second conference was held at University House, Edgbaston, Birmingham. Members attended from nine English universities. The proceedings began on Friday evening with the Chairman's address, followed by an informal discussion on teaching methods, curricula and textbooks. On Saturday, the morning was given over to a symposium on 'The Content and Aims of a University Course in Accounting', with four short papers by a professional accountant (W. H. Newton, senior partner in the firm of Newton & Co., Chartered Accountants, as well as Treasurer of Birmingham University), an industrial accountant (W. W. Fea, Chief Accountant of Guest, Keen & Nettlefolds Ltd), a business man (Eric W. Vincent, Director of Harry Vincent Ltd) and an academic economist (J. Glyn Picton, Lecturer in industrial economics at Birmingham University). In the report of the conference published in *The Accountant*, which was almost certainly written by David Solomons, the Association's Secretary, the following observation in support of university study in accounting was noted:

'Perhaps the most important point which emerged from the ensuing discussion was the unanimity among university teachers of accounting that professional firms who took newly-articled clerks immediately on the completion of their university studies in accounting might be disappointed if they expected these clerks to compete at once on level terms with clerks who had completed two years of the normal five-year period of articles. The graduate articled clerk would, of course, lack the practical experience that the five-year man would have begun to gain, and it was only at the end of their respective articles that a comparison of the two types of articled clerk would have nothing to fear.<sup>48</sup>

The afternoon was free, and the evening session on the theme of 'Weaknesses in Orthodox Accounting Theory' began with a short paper by Harry Norris, an industrial accountant who was the author of *Accounting Theory: An Outline of Its Structure* (1946). On Sunday morning, Solomons opened the discussion of 'Accounting Research—Illusion or Reality?' Following a free afternoon, an informal dinner was held, following which the Association's members entertained the Vice-chancellor of Birmingham University, a Member of the Council of the ICAEW (W. L. Barrows, a Birmingham practitioner), and the Presidents of the Birmingham and District Society of Chartered Accountants, and of the Birmingham District Society of Incorporated Accountants and Auditors. On Monday morning, members visited the Shaftmoor Lane works of Joseph Lucas Ltd, 'which included not only a brief inspection of the factory, but also an extremely instructive review of the company's costing methods'.<sup>49</sup>

At the general meeting of the Association held on Sunday morning, it was announced that G. W. Murphy, of the University of Manchester, would succeed to the Editorship of the Newsletter, as Baxter had asked to be relieved of his post. Cousins and Solomons were to continue in their respective capacities as Chairman and Secretary. The frequency of the Association's conferences was discussed. Since the joint meeting, held in Oxford, between representatives of the Universities and the Accountancy Profession was held biennially (in odd-numbered years), it was thought by some that the Association's conferences might also be held biennially in the years between the Oxford meetings. Reactions to this suggestion must have varied, since it was decided to hold the next conference in September 1950 and to defer until then a discussion of the timing of future conferences.

### THE 1950 CONFERENCE

Another weekend conference, this time labelled 'Annual' and a day shorter than its predecessor, was held from Friday evening to Sunday afternoon, 22–24 September 1950 at St. Anselm Hall, Victoria Park, Manchester. Friday evening was organized along the same lines as at the 1949 conference. G. W. Murphy, of the University of Manchester, was in charge of the arrangements. On Saturday morning, according to the conference announcement (no report of the conference appeared in *The Accountant*), W. Arthur Lewis, Stanley Jevons Professor of Political Economy in the University of Manchester, was to open a discussion on 'Accounting for Monopoly Control'. In the afternoon, members were to have a tour of the offices of Messrs Hartley Turner & Son, Chartered Accountants, 'where the partners will present and explain a system of control of professional work and charges'. In the evening there was to be a dinner at which 'a number of distinguished local accountants and university representatives' were to be guests. On Sunday morning, Ely Devons, Robert Ottley Professor of Applied Economics in the University of Manchester, was to open a discussion on 'Some Problems Arising from an Analysis of Costs and Prices in the Cotton Industry'. A short business session was to close the conference.

W. T. Baxter was elected as Chairman to succeed Cousins, and David Solomons, who was prevented from attending the conference owing to an attack of the flu, submitted his resignation as Secretary 'owing to other claims on my time' (Newsletter No. 3, p. 3).<sup>50</sup> C. A. Smith, of the University of Sheffield, was elected to succeed him. H. C. Edey, of LSE, and S. V. P. Cornwell, a practitioner in Bristol and part-time lecturer at the University, were elected to the Committee.

The members of the Association may have been hopeful that the ICAEW might become interested in supporting accounting research when the Institute announced in early 1950 that a London practitioner and well-known author, the late P. D. Leake, had bequeathed the residue of his estate, estimated to be £80,000, to the Institute. The bequest was to be held as the 'P. D. Leake Trust Fund' 'for such purposes falling within the legal definition of charity as are likely to benefit and advance the science of accounting and political economy including the subject of public finance and taxation'.<sup>51</sup> The Institute's Council must have been in a quandary over how to use the fund, since the conduct and support of studies in 'the science

of accounting and political economy' had never been one of the Councillors' interests. Finally, in 1954, the Council decided to establish the P. D. Leake Professorship of Finance and Accounting in the University of Cambridge, to be financed by an annual grant of £3,000. The professorship was awarded the following year to Richard N. (later Sir Richard) Stone, an economic statistician who was developing a system of national accounts (for which he received the Nobel Prize in economic sciences in 1984).<sup>52</sup> Howitt (1966, p. 113) has written that 'Grants have since been made for the establishment of a P. D. Leake Research Fellowship at Balliol College, Oxford, and for other Fellowships tenable at Oxford, London and Birmingham Universities'.

### THE THIRD NEWSLETTER-17 MONTHS AFTER NO. 2

G. W. Murphy, the new Editor, apologised profusely in Issue No. 3 of the Newsletter, dated December 1950, for the long delay in its publication. In his final Chairman's Foreword, Cousins wrote,

'The name and purpose of the Association have been most felicitously put on the map by the recent appearance of the volume "Studies in Accounting", edited by our new Chairman, William Baxter. He deserves a whole bunch of good marks for bringing together the twenty-six contributions which fill its pages, and I think the best tribute we can pay him in the first place to the very considerable amount of work that has gone into its compilation is to do our utmost to make its existence widely known.'

In the Secretary's report that had been submitted to the conference, Solomons wrote that, in somewhat less than 3 years since the Association's founding, its membership had increased from 13 persons representing 10 English and Welsh universities who attended the inaugural meeting, to 48 members from 23 universities, including six from Scotland and 11 from overseas, representing, Australia (A. A. Fitzgerald and Louis Goldberg, both of the University of Melbourne), Canada (Professor Kenneth F. Byrd, McGill University), Israel (David Rosolio, a practitioner in Tel Aviv and part-time lecturer at Hebrew University of Jerusalem), India (G. Basu, a practitioner in Calcutta), New Zealand (W. G. Rodger, of Victoria University College, and T. R. Johnston and Professor L. W. Holt, both of Auckland University College), South Africa (Thomas Cairns and Professor B. J. S. Wimble, both of the University of the Witwatersrand) and Thailand (Phya Jaiyos Sompati, University of Chulalongkorn, Bangkok). B. S. Yamey, by then at the London School of Economics, had joined whilst he was at the University of Cape Town. Of the 48, 16 were full-time teachers, 25 were part-time teachers, five were former teachers (a new category authorized at the 1949 conference), and two (Bray and de Paula) were honorary members.

The Newsletter again contained reports from the antipodes, written, as

before, by Goldberg and Rodger.<sup>53</sup> There were three signed book reviews, two by Baxter, and a long list of 'books on accounting or relevant to accounting', evidently compiled by Baxter. The Newsletter concluded with the first published list of members.

### NEWSLETTER NO. 4-THE LAST TO APPEAR

After a year's lapse, Issue No. 4, the last in the series of Newsletters, came out in December 1951. In his Chairman's Foreword, Baxter reflected on a recent book published by an economic historian who had made heavy use of old accounts and business documents, and he challenged his colleagues in the Association either to rise to new heights in their research or to accept a supporting role in the research conducted in established disciplines. Baxter's message caught the attention of the Editor of *The Accountant*, who reproduced the following extract:

'From every point of view, it is extremely desirable that the discussion of accounting theory should flourish. Ultimately, such speculations will be useful to professional life, besides enriching our academic studies. But somehow our work is not yet very impressive. Indeed, much of it seems hardly to merit the name "research". That word suggests—to my mind at least—something of rare quality and originality ...

'The fundamental issues of accounting (e.g. theories of capital and revenue) have still to be explored, but only the most brilliant and ambitious student has any chance of doing useful work here.

'Does this mean that we should discourage the would-be researcher? To some extent, yes; a continuation of the present flow of third-rate output can lead only to the discredit of accounting research. Where an inquiring mind refuses to be discouraged, perhaps the best route for it to follow is one in which accounting knowledge can throw light on another subject. There is much to be said for winning one's spurs in a field whose standards have long been regarded as rigorous ...

'Research in economic history offers great scope for accounting methods. Some aspects of national statistics may well do likewise. Detailed studies of the law's inter-relations with accounting should also be fruitful. In short, our best plan may for the nonce be to treat accounting as a tool rather than an end.'<sup>54</sup>

It was reported in the Newsletter that an Association sub-committee was preparing a memorandum to be submitted on behalf of the Association to the Royal Commission on Taxation of Profits and Income. The subcommittee was composed of Baxter, Solomons and H. C. Edey (Association members at LSE) and two economists, R. C. Tress and A. T. (now Sir Alan) Peacock.

#### S. A. ZEFF

The Newsletter contained some correspondence from Australia and South Africa, a report from New Zealand, three signed book reviews (including one each by Solomons and Baxter), a list of members, and the memorandum shortly to be submitted to the Royal Commission.

### THE 1952 CONFERENCE

The Association's fourth conference was held on the weekend of 28–30 March 1952 at Burwalls, a hall of residence in the University of Bristol.<sup>55</sup> A meeting in the spring was believed to be more convenient for members than in September. S. V. P. Cornwell was primarily responsible for the administrative arrangements. On Saturday morning, papers were read by two visitors, R. C. Tress, Professor of Political Economy in the University of Bristol, on 'The Use of Accounting Terms and Concepts by Economists',<sup>56</sup> and I. F. Pearce, Lecturer in industrial administration in the University of Nottingham, on 'Cost Accounting and Economic Theory'. On Saturday afternoon, a discussion was held between those members interested in teaching in taxation.

A business meeting was held on Sunday morning, following which F. J. Weeks, who was a member of the management accounting team of the Anglo-American Council on Productivity, spoke on 'Some Impressions of American Industrial Accountancy'.

At the business meeting, Brian Magee, of the University of Bristol,<sup>57</sup> was elected to succeed Baxter as Chairman on 1 August 1952. C. C. Magee (Brian Magee's brother), of the University of Wales, was elected Secretary and Treasurer, and H. C. Edey and J. Kitchen, both of LSE, were elected as Joint Editors of the Newsletter. The Committee was to be composed of Donald Cousins, C. A. Smith, and, upon his retirement as Chairman, Baxter.<sup>58</sup>

During the week following the Sixth International Congress on Accounting, held in June 1952 in London, the Association scheduled a meeting at LSE 'at which members of similar bodies from oversea will have a chance to meet one another and discuss matters of common interest'.<sup>59</sup>

### THE 1955 CONFERENCE

No further activity was reported until 1955, when the Association held its fifth conference on the weekend of 25–27 March at Hugh Stewart Hall, University of Nottingham.<sup>60</sup> Following tea and dinner on Friday, David Solomons gave an address entitled 'The Teaching of Accounting in American Universities'. Solomons had spent a term in 1954 as a visiting professor at the University of California. On Saturday morning, Donal O'Donovan, of the Organisation and Methods Division of HM Treasury, spoke on the work

of his department. Three films were shown in the afternoon: 'Accounting the Language of Business', borrowed from *The Accountant*, and 'Enterprise' and 'Balance 1950', obtained from the Imperial Chemical Industries Film Library. A dinner was held in the evening. A short business meeting took place on Sunday morning, following which Brian Tew, Professor of Economics at Nottingham, addressed the conference on 'Company Accounts as a Source of Economic Statistics'.

At the business meeting, Solomons was elected Chairman, and S. V. P. Cornwell was elected Secretary. Members attended from Birmingham, Bristol, Cardiff, London, Manchester, Nottingham, Sheffield and South-ampton, as well as from Melbourne.<sup>61</sup>

# **ACTIVITIES DURING 1957**

A meeting of the Committee was held on 30 March 1957 in conjunction with the fifth conference of the Joint Standing Committee of the Universities and the Accountancy Profession, which took place at the University of Liverpool on the weekend of 29–31 March.<sup>62</sup> Solomons, who was in the chair, proposed that:

'the Association should undertake a specific piece of work partly because the work was necessary and partly to enliven the Association's activities. His proposal was that the Association should sponsor a study group on accounting education'.<sup>63</sup>

The other members of the Committee—Edey, Baxter (who had just been co-opted), Brian Magee, C. A. Whittington-Smith (formerly C. A. Smith) and Cornwell—agreed the proposal and authorized the Chairman to 'put out feelers' to the individuals tentatively suggested for membership on the study group. The Committee decided, however, 'To do nothing overt until the dust of the integration arrangements [between the Society of Incorporated Accountants and the three chartered institutes in the British Isles] had settled, except to get the group organised'.<sup>64</sup>

Among the individuals suggested for the education study group were Solomons and Baxter; Sir Harold Barton, a past President and long-time member of the Council (1928–1957) of the ICAEW; Eric Hay Davison, an industrial accountant who was known for his reformist views; Leo T. Little, an economist who was the Editor of *Accountancy* and Joint Editor of *Accounting Research*; and W. E. Parker, a senior partner in Price Waterhouse & Co. and a member of the Council of the ICAEW.

Solomons' views on accounting education were diametrically opposed to those held by most leaders of the ICAEW. On 10 November 1955, Solomons (and Whittington-Smith) had attended the annual dinner of the Bristol and West of England Society of Chartered Accountants, at which W. S. (later Sir William) Carrington, the President of the ICAEW and a senior partner in one of the oldest English accountancy firms, set out his views on accounting education with pungent directnesss:

'Whilst I think that the special degree courses now being provided at certain of the universities have a place in our system of professional education, I can foresee grave dangers unless university lecturers and professors are careful to avoid feeding their students with arguments and propositions which they are not mature enough fully to appreciate or even digest properly ... In saying this, I am not seeking to detract at all from the value of university chairs of accounting, but I do think that their main value will be in the field of research and post-graduate study and I don't want them to feed the young on champagne and caviare before they are properly weaned."<sup>65</sup>

Four weeks later, Solomons delivered his inaugural lecture as Professor of Accounting at Bristol under the title, 'Accounting Education for New Responsibilities', in which he derided the Institute's total reliance on articles of apprenticeship and correspondence tuition in the preparation of future chartered accountants. He said, 'much of the educational value of practical experience will be lost if the ground has not adequately been prepared in advance' and 'I find it utterly incomprehensible that any profession should think [correspondence tuition is] other than a third-rate substitute for real education' (Solomons, 1956, p. 117). He proposed instead that candidates for membership in the Institute be required to complete 3 years of university study in economics, accounting and law, to be followed by 3 years of office work, interspersed with periods of full-time practical training. At the conclusion of his address, Solomons quoted from Carrington's speech and asked why the Institute should fear that students be exposed to 'the critical discussion of accepted ideas' (Solomons, 1956, p. 120). Solomons was vexed by views such as Carrington's, and he was looking for ways to engage the Institute leadership in a dialogue. Also, as noted above, Solomons was keen to 'enliven' the Association's activities. On 6 November 1957, Solomons wrote to Sidebotham that the Association:

'has shown only the barest signs of life since it held its last conference in Nottingham at Easter 1955. There would have been a conference last Easter but for the fact that many members attended the conference on the "Universities and the Accountancy Profession" at Liverpool ... I do not think we can go much longer without calling the members together and my idea is that we should organize a conference for Easter 1958.'

At the meeting of 30 March, it became known that Cornwell wished to be relieved of his duties as Secretary and Treasurer, owing to the pressure of professional and other commitments. (Sometime between 1955 and 1957 the title of the position was altered to include 'and Treasurer'.) It was unanimously agreed that Solomons should approach Roy Sidebotham, of the University of Manchester, about taking on the job. In April, Sidebotham, who had never attended an Association conference, accepted the position 'for a while, anyway', since, as he wrote to Solomons on 25 October 1957, 'As you will appreciate, I feel my position in AUTA to be rather curious. I am, in effect, the executive officer of an organisation only two of whose members (Mr. Murphy and Professor Baxter) have I ever met'.

Also at the meeting there was concern expressed over the future of Accounting Research in the light of the proposed integration of the Society of Incorporated Accountants into the three chartered institutes in the British Isles, which had been announced the previous December.<sup>66</sup> Edey was asked 'to make an entirely informal approach, in a guarded manner, to Mr. Leo T. Little, one of the joint editors'.<sup>67</sup> The Committee also resolved to ask Sweet & Maxwell, Ltd, the UK publishers of Studies in the History of Accounting, edited by A. C. Littleton and B. S. Yamey, if copies could be made available to Association members on trade terms comparable to what had been done for the first two collections in the series, edited by Baxter and Solomons. (In the event, Sweet & Maxwell granted Association members a discount of 25%, at a price of  $f_{11}$  17s 6d. Fifteen members ordered the book.) The Littleton and Yamev collection had been 'Edited on behalf of The Association of the University Teachers of Accounting and the American Accounting Association', and was published in 1956 simultaneously by Richard D. Irwin, Inc. in the United States and Sweet & Maxwell in the UK. It was Baxter's suggestion that Yamey do a book on history for the series, and he also proposed that it be done in concert with the AAA.<sup>68</sup> Baxter exchanged correspondence with Professor Frank P. Smith, the AAA President in 1954, on the publication arrangements.<sup>69</sup> Unlike the Baxter and Solomons volumes, which were collections of previously published writings, almost every article was commissioned specifically for the volume by Littleton and Yamey.

The Association continued to be small. In September 1957, its list of members showed 66 individuals, of whom 23 were resident outside the British Isles. As no subscription reminders had been sent out since 1953, much of the list might have been out of date. At the bottom of a copy of the list seen by the author, the following note was written by hand: 'Some of these members we have not heard of or from for a long time'.

At a meeting of the Committee on 17 December 1957, held at LSE, with Solomons in the chair, and Edey, Magee and Sidebotham in attendance, it was decided that the 1958 conference should be on accounting education, and that the proposal for a study group on education be deferred for further consideration after the conference. Sidebotham reported that the Association had a balance of cash on hand of £89 5s 8d.<sup>70</sup>

### THE EDUCATION CONFERENCE IN 1958

It was announced in *The Accountant* of 8 March 1958 that the Association would be holding a conference on accounting education on 28/29 March

at LSE.<sup>71</sup> Solomons, who was principal organizer of the conference and the editor of its proceedings, believed that 'there had never been an opportunity in this country for members of all the principal bodies in the accountancy profession to meet together and discuss the problems of professional education and training which are of concern to them all' (*Accounting Education*, 1958, p. i).<sup>72</sup> Thus, Solomons set the stage for the dialogue between academics and practitioners that he had envisaged in his inaugural lecture given in December 1955.

The conference consisted of three panel sessions: The Professional Bodies and Accounting Education, chaired by Solomons; Educational Arrangements of Solicitors, Architects and Scottish Chartered Accountants, chaired by Baxter; and General Discussion, chaired by Brian Magee. There were 21 principal participants, of whom four were panellists in the first session and another four were panellists in the second session. The longest presentation was made by Edey, who opened the final session. In advance of the conference, Solomons had sent each of the panel members a list of possible questions, and solicited their comments. During each of the first two sessions, the chairman addressed questions to the panellists, and an active discussion ensued.

A General Meeting of the Association was held immediately following the third session. Edey was elected Chairman,<sup>73</sup> and Sidebotham was reelected as Secretary and Treasurer. The following were elected to the Committee: Cousins, Baxter, Solomons, Brian Magee and C. A. Whittington-Smith. In discussion, it was suggested that future conferences might be held in 2 out of every 3 years.<sup>74</sup> Concern was expressed about the future of *Accounting Research*, and it was resolved unanimously:

'That in the opinion of this Association, the discontinuance of the publication of "Accounting Research" would be regrettable. In the event of this becoming reality, the committee are empowered to take such action as they deem desirable.'

Accounting Research ceased publication following its issue for October 1958, a year following the transfer of the journal from the Society of Incorporated Accountants to the ICAEW.<sup>75</sup>

The education conference was supported with some funds from the Society of Incorporated Accountants. Leo T. Little, the Editor of Accountancy (the Society's journal until November 1957, when it was transferred to the ICAEW), provided recording facilities for the conference, and Solomons undertook to edit a volume of proceedings. Since an approach for funds to the P. D. Leake Committee of the ICAEW had been unavailing, and in view of the fact that the transcript consisted of dialogue involving as many as 21 participants, Solomons had concluded that it would be infeasible, if only on grounds of cost, to verify the text with each speaker. However, in November, after 500 copies of the proceedings volume had been printed and copies were distributed to participants, one of the panellists, H. O. H.

Coulson, a partner in the London firm of Barton, Mayhew & Co. and a fellow of the ICAEW, complained of several misquotations and that an important part of his remarks had been omitted from the proceedings.<sup>76</sup> In fact, part of Coulson's remarks, as well as some of Solomons' own remarks, had been lost, owing to the fact that a reel of recording tape had been burnt in Accountancy's office. Solomons offered 'to insert an erratum slip correcting any instances of material misreporting before distribution is resumed',<sup>77</sup> but Coulson contended that the errors of commission and omission in the conference report were too pervasive and extensive to be handled in such a manner.<sup>78</sup> He was irate that he had not been given the courtesy of reviewing the transcript prior to publication. A further obstacle to resuming distribution was the decision announced by the ICAEW's Investigation Committee that it was impermissible to show its members' designatory initials and firm names in the 'List of Principal Participants' in a generalist publication such as the proceedings volume, as these would allow improper inferences of authority and, one supposes, an appearance of self-promotion. In the end, following a tense exchange of letters, Coulson vaguely threatened legal action if distribution of the conference report were resumed. Solomons, who had done yeoman's work in directing the conference and editing the proceedings, must have been bitterly disappointed. All of the undistributed copies of the volume of proceedings, which ran to 54 pages of single-spaced typescript, had to be destroyed, and the copies sent to journals for review were withdrawn 80

# SUBMISSIONS AND ORAL TESTIMONY TO THE PARKER COMMITTEE

In August 1958, the ICAEW's Council appointed a Committee on Education and Training, chaired by W. E. Parker, of Price Waterhouse & Co., with the following terms of reference:

'To consider the education and training appropriate for entrants to the profession, the existing arrangements and facilities therefor, and the changes, if any, which should be made so as to ensure the provision of an adequate supply of trained candidates suitable in all respects for admission to membership of the Institute; and to make recommendations.'<sup>80</sup>

Parker had given an address at the ICAEW's summer course in July 1957 on 'Training for the Profession', in which, amongst other things, he was sceptical of any role that full-time or even part-time academic study might play in preparing candidates for entry into the profession (1957). In any event, the 11-member Parker Committee was safely in the hands of the conservative Establishment: six of its members were past Presidents or would soon become Presidents of the Institute, including Parker himself.

#### S. A. ZEFF

In response to the Parker Committee's request for written comments, the Association submitted a memorandum on 15 January 1959 that had been drafted by Solomons (with advice from Edey and Baxter) and reviewed by members of its Committee.<sup>81</sup> Submitted under the name of the Association's office-bearers, Edey and Sidebotham, the memorandum struck a chord that would have resonated with many of the Association's members:

'It is probably not too much to say that on no profession of comparable importance in England and Wales have the universities made so little impact as on the accountancy profession' (para. 35).

The memorandum adopted as self-evident the importance of theoretical study in the preparation of Chartered Accountants, and it proposed that non-graduate clerks should spend an aggregate of 30% of their 5-year articles in block-release courses at a technical college.

In July 1959, David Solomons left the UK for a professorship at the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania. The long-standing antipathy of some, though not all, of the leading members of the ICAEW toward a place for universities in the education and training of articled clerks, compounded by the distressing correspondence with Coulson during the winter of 1958–1959, were important reasons why Solomons, who had been the catalyst in the Association, resigned his professorship at Bristol and left for the United States.

Also in July, the Parker Committee invited the Association to send a delegation to give oral evidence to the Committee. At Parker's request, the Association set about preparing a supplementary written submission. After extensive correspondence among members of the Committee, including suggestions by mail from Solomons, the Association provided 'twenty copies of draft syllabuses in economics, statistics and financial mathematics and some examples, with feasible solutions, of the type of question [the] Association would like to see set in the Institute's examinations'.<sup>82</sup> In the Association's submission of 15 January, these subjects were recommended to broaden the Institute's syllabus. In a passage surely written by Solomons, the Association had said: '[These subjects] are surely of greater importance than the minutiae of bankruptcy law or executorship' (para. 24).

Edey, Sidebotham, Baxter and Cousins met with the Parker Committee on 17 December 1959 to discuss the Association's submissions. They were accompanied, at Parker's request, by Professor F. A. Wells, of the University of Nottingham's Department of Industrial Economics, who had made a separate submission to the Committee.

In its report issued in 1961, the Parker Committee rejected the Association's proposals and gave scant encouragement to those who favoured a role for the universities in the preparation of Chartered Accountants (*Report of the Committee on Education and Training*, 1961).<sup>83</sup>

#### AUTA 1947-1959

### STATE OF THE ASSOCIATION IN 1959

At a meeting of the Committee on 5 January 1959, the Secretary was instructed to levy a subscription of 10s on each member. Although the membership list drawn up in September 1957 had shown 66 names, in May 1959 the Secretary reported that only 32 members had paid the subscription levy, including 10 who were outside the UK. Of the 22 members residing in the UK, 19 were academics, of whom 13 were said to be full-time.<sup>84</sup> The Secretary said that the balance in the Association's account was  $\pounds$ 80. Interest in the Association's affairs clearly was on the wane.

#### **REVIEW OF THE PERIOD 1947–1959**

The influence of Baxter, Solomons and Edey in the early stages of the Association's development was palpable. When one or two of this trio were active in the Association's leadership, conferences were held with regularity, a Newsletter was put out in a timely manner, publications were issued in the Association's name, gauntlets were thrown down to stimulate a higher quality of accounting research, and submissions were made to policy-making bodies.

Conferences were held in 1947, 1949, 1950, 1952, 1955 and 1958, and one or both of Baxter and Solomons were leading figures in each of the six. Baxter was Chairman from 1950 to 1952 and Solomons was Secretary from 1947 to 1950 and Chairman from 1955 to 1958, and one or both served on the Committee during most of its existence. Baxter was Editor of the first two issues of the Newsletter, and much of the content of Nos 3 and 4 was the work of Baxter and Solomons. It was Baxter and Solomons who compiled the first two anthologies of articles that were published in the name of the Association. Baxter, Solomons and Edey were the three Association members who, together with two economists, wrote the Association's memorandum to a Royal Commission, and Solomons drafted the Association's submission to the Parker Committee. Solomons, with help from Baxter and Edey (and Sidebotham), directed the accounting education conference held at LSE in 1958, which, but for the accidental loss of some of the transcript, would have led to another publication in the Association's name.

S. V. P. Cornwell, the former Association Secretary and Solomons' colleague at Bristol, writes: 'From 1954 to 1960 the motivating force in AUTA was (almost exclusively) David Solomons'.<sup>85</sup> Following Solomons' departure for America in 1959 and the preparation a few months later of the Committee's testimony to the Parker Committee (to which Solomons contributed from overseas), the Association became dormant.

#### S. A. ZEFF

#### **AFTERWORD**

The 1960s were a decade in which no activities of the Association were reported in *The Accountant*. Following the 1958 education conference, the next notice to appear in *The Accountant* was in 1971, when it was announced that B. V. Carsberg, of the University of Manchester, had succeeded P. A. Bird, of the University of Kent, as Chairman. Other newly elected office-bearers were J. F. Flower, of the University of Bristol, as Vice-Chairman; E. A. Lowe, of the Manchester Business School, as Secretary/Treasurer; and K. Wallis, of the University of Manchester, as *News Review* Editor. It was reported that a new constitution had been adopted at general meetings the Association held on 30 March at Darwin College, University of Kent.<sup>86</sup>

That the Association's institutional memory may have become a blank after a long period of apparent inactivity is borne out by the following report in *The Accountant* in 1973:

'It came as something of a surprise to both members and committee members attending the annual conference of the Association of University Teachers of Accounting in Edinburgh last week, when Professor David Solomons announced during his talk that he "could claim credit for being a founder member of the Association" and that 1973 appeared to be its 25th year of life.<sup>87</sup>

In 1965, it was reported in *The Accountant* that an Association of Lecturers in Accountancy had been formed,<sup>88</sup> evidently to serve the interests of lecturers in the colleges, but none of those who had been active in the AUTA were mentioned in successive reports, which continued into the 1970s.

#### Notes

- In the United States, where academic accounting developed earlier than anywhere else among English-speaking countries, the first full professors of accounting, all serving part-time, were appointed in 1900 by New York University (Lockwood, 1938, pp. 141–144). In 1904, Henry Rand Hatfield became the first full-time academic with a professorial title in accounting at a US university (Associate Professor of Accounting, University of California). He became Professor of Accounting in 1909.
- 2. In 1903, Dicksee was named to LSE's newly created Professorial Council, which dealt with matters of academic policy. In its annual calendar, LSE referred to Dicksee as Professor, in deference to his appointment at Birmingham.
- 3. Craner & Jones (1996, 11) report that Martineau 'went to Emmanuel College, Cambridge where he won Exhibitions in his first and second years and graduated "Senior Optime" in 1884 in the Mathematics Tripos'. He was admitted to the ICAEW in 1888, 'having passed the Final with "Distinction" and gained the Institute prize'. He practised for 3 years, up to 1891, and then entered the export trade, from which he retired in 1932.
- 4. In 1912, degrees containing an accounting element were offered at only the following British universities: Birmingham, Manchester, Leeds, Liverpool and LSE (only as an optional subject) (Edwards, 1989, p. 284).

- 5. The Senate conferred the lectureship on Dicksee in November 1913 and the personal professorship in January 1915. He was appointed to the Cassel Chair in July 1920. This information was supplied by Miss Ann Hewison, Academic Office, Senate House, University of London, by letter dated 22 October 1996.
- 6. In a letter to Sir William (later Lord) Beveridge, director of LSE, dated 2 December 1929, de Paula expressed confusion over the use of different titles: 'The title of the Chair is—Accountancy and Business Methods', and the title of the Reader's appointment is—'Accounting and Business Organisation'. I do not understand quite why there is this difference in the two titles, nor do I fully appreciate what is meant by "Business Methods"'.
- 7. The Accountant, 7 January 1933, p. 11. In a letter written by Mrs. J. Mair, secretary of LSE, dated 2 December 1929, Professor Harold Laski is reported to have said 'that the chair should be converted into something else because there wasn't an individual in the School who thought accountancy a subject for a chair' (anecdote supplied by LSE). It thereupon became a chair of commerce. De Paula's successor in the Chair was Arnold Plant as Cassel Professor of Commerce, who, as it happens, created an intellectual climate that did much to stimulate accounting research at LSE in the 1930s (Baxter, 1991, p. 139) and served on the Committee of the Accounting Research Association (ARA) (see below) (Napier, 1996a, p. 442). For references to Plant's role in the ARA, see *The Accountant*, 28 November 1936, p. 730, and 19 December 1936, p. 841.
- 8. Some indication of the pressures with which part-time professors had to cope is suggested by W. T. Baxter's recollection of a constraint under which Annan said he laboured: 'he was a partner in a busy firm, and his university work was limited to three lectures a week; lack of time thus made it impossible for him to do as good a job as he wanted' (Baxter, 1978, p. 4 of Preface). Between 1934 and 1936, Baxter, who had previously been employed in Annan's firm, was a lecturer at the University of Edinburgh. He has written, 'Though my job was described as part-time, in fact I made it full-time'. Letter to the author from Baxter, dated 18 November 1995.
- 9. The University ordinance setting up the Chair prescribed a limited tenure of 12 years. Letter to the author from David Flint, dated 8 December 1995.
- 10. Letter to the author from Nóirín Moynihan, of The National University of Ireland, dated 30 August 1996.
- 11. The author is grateful to David Flint for apprising him of the Chair and to Professor S. Collins, of the University College Galway, for furnishing particulars. Useful information was also supplied by Peter Clarke and Niamh Brennan, both of University College Dublin. The biographical information about Shields was obtained from his listing in *Who's Who*, and that about McBryan was found in Fanning (1984, p. 142). Prior to 1922, when the Irish Free State came into existence, Ireland was part of the UK.
- 12. An extract from *The Financial Times* article was reproduced in *The Accountant*, 16 October 1926, pp. 515–516; the quotation is from p. 515. A week later, *The Accountant* reported that Nottingham and Leicester indeed had accountancy lectureships, and observed: 'It is apparent that accountancy is becoming more and more a part of the regular curriculum of modern universities' (23 October 1926, p. 552). 'It has been suggested that one reason why accounting has struggled to achieve academic status in Britain is because universities saw themselves as institutions capable of producing "well-rounded gentlemen" rather than an individual trained to enter the market' (Edwards, 1989, p. 284).
- 13. Accountant, 16 October 1926, p. 515. The condition in India, including Ceylon, was found to be 'lamentable' (at p. 516).
- 14. The Incorporated Accountants' Journal, February 1935, p. 161.
- 15. Accounting Research thus became only the second English-language journal in the world devoted to accounting theory and research. The first was *The Accounting Review*, begun in 1926.
- 16. See Accounting Research, January 1953, pp. 103-104.

#### S. A. ZEFF

- 17. For a report of the organizational meeting, see *The Accountant*, 28 November 1936, pp. 730–731. Gordon writes: 'The project [to form the ARA] was due to our realization of the fact that up to that time hardly any work which could rank as *research* had been done in England, least of all by the professional bodies'. Letter to the author from Cosmo Gordon, dated 9 December 1964.
- 18. The Accountant ran a leader in which the Editor welcomed the ARA and ventured the view that accounting should be a learned profession as well as a practical profession. The Accountant, 5 December 1936, p. 759. A recollection by Davison concerning the founding of the ARA is reported in Mumford (1991, p. 136).
- 19. Sir Josiah's speech was reproduced in The Accountant, 2 January 1937, pp. 15-19.
- 20. Letter to the author from Sir Ronald Edwards, dated 30 November 1964.
- 21. Edwards writes: 'The Accounting Research Association really came to an end during the war years. Those of us who started it were unable to do anything to keep it going for about seven years, and afterwards some thought that it was unnecessary to revive it. Personally, I have some doubt about that, but I had to some extent by then shifted my interest. I tend to alter my career about once every ten years'. Letter to the author from Sir Ronald Edwards, dated 30 November 1964.
- 22. The efforts at LSE to integrate economics and accounting are treated by Napier (1996*a*). A useful source on the stages of evolution of accounting at LSE is Dev (1980).
- 23. Kitchen reports that 'Rowland in fact followed de Paula at LSE in taking charge of the work there in accounting until 1946 (the year of his death), though he was not granted the status of professor' (1978, 29). Edey observes that Rowland's published work carried forward the practice-orientated tradition of Dicksee and de Paula (1974, pp. 1–2).

In January 1939, Rowland gave an address at the inaugural meeting of The Accountants' Group, which appears to have been more of an activist discussion group than a research forum (as was the ARA). In his address, Rowland insisted that 'Accounting must remain in its essence a record of past events ...' (1939*a*, p. 131). In an address the following month to the annual general meeting of the ARA, Rowland inveighed against researchers who, not bred of experience in the practice of accountancy, would instruct the profession (1939*b*, p. 444). The reference to Edwards and other like-minded researchers (such as Coase, whose article he cited) was evident.

- 24. Baxter's appointment took effect on 1 May instead of on the usual 1 October owing to an agreement reached between LSE and the University of Cape Town (UCT) at Baxter's request. In March 1947, when Baxter's LSE appointment was approved, he was residing in Edinburgh on leave from UCT. His leave expired on 30 June, and, as a convenience to Baxter, LSE and UCT agreed the date of 1 May for both his resignation from UCT and appointment at LSE so as to make it unnecessary for him to return to UCT for the months of July and August following the expiry of his leave. (This information was found in Baxter's personnel file at LSE.)
- 25. The report was published in *The Accountant*, 28 April 1945, pp. 202–204, together with an introductory article on pp. 198–199. Commenting on the report, *The Economist* wrote, 'Accountancy has hitherto tended to be one of those professions—banking, insurance and the solicitor's branch of the law are other examples—which have, by the force of circumstances and their own professional requirements, held themselves somewhat aloof from the main stream of the nation's intellectual life' (5 May 1945, p. 576).
- 26. A report of the first conference appears in The Accountant, 3 May 1947, p. 248.
- 27. Although he judged the progress of the 'Universities scheme' to be 'satisfactory' following the first 5 years after it went into effect in 1946, Nicholas Stacey nonetheless concluded that its impact on the overall intake of new accounting professionals was insignificant. By 1950–1951, he reported, the number of university students enrolled in the 'scheme' was 350, compared with 'the number of students of the recognized accountancy societies, which in 1951 numbered over 30,000' (1954, p. 254). Solomons (1951, p. 40) attributed the slow start to the immediate post-war need to reserve a large number of university places for ex-service men, who were usually well above the normal age of university

32

#### AUTA 1947-1959

students and 'were not attracted to a scheme which demanded of them a minimum of five years between entering the university and finally obtaining membership of a professional body, as compared with a minimum of three years for non-graduate exservice candidates'. With the return to normal conditions, Solomons reported a 'distinct increase' in applications for admission to accounting courses.

- 28. The Accountant, 14 January 1950, p. 29.
- 29. Ibid., p. 30.
- 30. Ibid., p. 29.
- 31. One of the members of Carr-Saunders' Committee on Education for Commerce was F. R. M. de Paula, an industrial accountant who was on the Council of the ICAEW. De Paula resigned from the Council at the end of 1949 'on grounds of health and other commitments', a few weeks after publication of the committee report (Kitchen & Parker, 1980, p. 120). De Paula clearly would have supported the committee's recommendations, and might even have believed that they did not go far enough. As long ago as 1928 he had written, 'In my opinion our professional education requires to be raised to a University level...' (*The Accountant*, 1 December 1928, p. 711). Whether his resignation was prompted by the abhorrence expressed in the ICAEW Council toward the report is not known.
- 32. The decision by The Society of Accountants in Edinburgh to initiate compulsory attendance in law classes at the University of Edinburgh was taken in 1866 (Walker, 1988, p. 151). Part-time attendance at university classes in economics and accountancy began to be required in 1926 (Shackleton, 1992, p. 420).
- 33. Early in 1933, de Paula wrote to *The Accountant*, 'I would ... suggest that the [English] Institute should take a direct interest in the teaching of accountancy at the modern universities. So far as I am aware, up to date it has not done so'. *The Accountant*, 7 January 1933, p. 11. Eight months later, in another letter to *The Accountant*, de Paula wrote that, 'so far as I can judge, [the discontinuance of the chair of accountancy at LSE] has passed unnoticed by the profession' (9 September 1933, pp. 419–420). Also see his letter in *The Accountant*, 1 January 1927, p. 31.
- 34. For a history of the first 50 years of the AAA, see Zeff (1966).
- 35. Minutes of the Inaugural Meeting of the Association of University Teachers of Accounting, held at the London School of Economics, on 22/23 December 1947.
- 36. Ibid., p. 1.
- 37. Edey writes that the 'mechanics and name [of the Association] were stimulated by the existence of the AUTE'. Letter to R. H. Parker from H. C. Edey, dated 5 September 1996. That the American Accounting Association was not a likely organizational model is suggested by the fact that Cousins, Baxter, Solomons and Edey were not members of the AAA in the 1940s. Of the four, Solomons was the first to join the AAA, in 1954 (information supplied by the AAA). Moreover, the AAA is not mentioned in Baxter's introduction to his *Studies in Accounting* (1950), although it is cited by Solomons in the Preface to his *Studies in Costing* (1952, p. vi).
- 38. Minutes, op. cit., p. 2.
- 39. The Accountant, 31 January 1948, p. 94.
- 40. Minutes, op. cit., p. 4.
- 41. *Ibid.*, p. 5. On 16 January 1948, Sewell Bray wrote to Baxter concerning the plans for his new journal. In the attached prospectus, it was rather grandly stated that the journal 'will provide for accountancy a periodical of the standing of "The Economic Journal" in economics, or "The Journal of the Royal Statistical Society" in statistics', and 'the intention is to provide a scholarly medium for making known advanced work undertaken by accountants whether they are engaged in professional practice, in industry or in University or other teaching'. On 21 January, Baxter replied that 'There is certainly a great need for such an undertaking and I think that the profession owes you and Mr. [Leo T.] Little a debt for shouldering the burden. I hope that the venture is a great

success, and I should like to be one of the subscribers'. He foresaw no conflict between Bray's journal and the activities of the Association. Also see Bray (1949).

- 42. Sir Harold had served as President of the ICAEW in 1944–1945, and House was to become ICAEW President in 1954–1955. In December 1947, at the time of the dinner, both were members of the Council of the ICAEW. House and Wiseman had represented the Institute and the ACCA, respectively, on the McNair Committee and were serving on the Joint Standing Committee of the Universities and the Accountancy Profession. See Accountancy, May 1945, p. 143, and April 1948, p. 81.
- 43. Minutes of Meeting of the Committee of the Association of University Teachers of Accounting, held at London School of Economics, Houghton Street, Aldwych, London, WC2, on 14 July 1948, p. 3.
- 44. Basil Yamey, who, though an academic economist, was a member of the Association, published three articles in the last four issues of *Accounting Research* and had an article in the 1959 volume of *The Accounting Review*. Sewell Bray, a practitioner who held academic posts (but not in a university accounting department), published many articles in *Accounting Research* and one in *The Accounting Review* during the 12-year period. In 1956–1957, Gerald H. Lawson, then an economic research student at the University of Durham, published two comments on a joint costing article in the *Review*. Lawson later became a finance professor at Manchester Business School and has written extensively in the accounting literature.
- 45. Minutes of Meeting of the Committee of the Association of University Teachers of Accounting, held at the London School of Economics, Houghton Street, Aldwych, London WC2 on 9 December 1948, p. 2.
- 46. Letter to Association members from C. C. Magee, Hon. Secretary, dated March 1953.
- 47. 'The Universities and the Accountancy Profession: Report of the Conference', The Accountant, 18 June 1949, p. 522.
- 48. The Accountant, 22 October 1949, p. 448. Some of the information in this section is based on the provisional programme for the conference, which was distributed by the Secretary.
- 49. Ibid.
- 50. A year earlier, Solomons had been promoted to a readership (the first full-time accounting readership at LSE), and the demands imposed by this appointment may have played a role in his resignation.
- 51. Report and Accounts 1949, The Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales, p. 37.
- 52. Napier (1996b, p. 469) reports that the Institute initially offered the funding for accounting education at Oxford University, which turned it down, and then made its approach to Cambridge, which used the funding to endow a chair for Stone. Stone held the Leake Professorship until his retirement in 1980, following which the funding was not renewed.
- 53. In the 1950s, Goldberg was active in discussions that led, in 1958, to the founding of what eventually became the Australasian Association of University Teachers of Accounting, which, in 1972, changed its name to the Accounting Association of Australia and New Zealand (Goldberg, 1987, chaps. 1–2).
- 54. The Accountant, 1 March 1952, p. 234.
- 55. At the time of the conference, accountancy was a field in England and Wales in which all but three university appointments were at a junior level. In a letter dated 8th January 1952 to the editor of *Der Wirtschaftsprüfer*, Solomons wrote that, apart from the two professors (Baxter and Cousins) and himself as reader, 'There are no other persons in this country teaching accounting at universities who hold positions above that of lecturer' (in the Solomons files).
- 56. In 1951, a committee composed of distinguished accountants and economists, formed under the auspices of the ICAEW and the National Institute of Economic and Social Research, issued a booklet entitled Some Accounting Terms and Concepts (1951), which

reported the results of 'an examination of the major accounting concepts and of the more important terms commonly used by both accountants and economists' (Foreword). In his paper, which was published in *Accounting Research* (1952), Tress did not mention the Committee's report.

Tress was 'a convinced supporter of the importance of Accountancy as a subject in the [Bristol] Economics Department, and he was the motivating force in the establishment of a separate Chair of Accountancy, and its acceptance in 1954 by David Solomons'. Communication to the author from S. V. P. Cornwell, dated 14 September 1995. The Bristol Chair was the third in Britain to be established on a full-time basis, but was only the second to be devoted solely to accounting.

- 57. Magee, then a lecturer at Bristol, was a graduate of LSE (BCom, 1926) and from 1931 to 1935 he had been Assistant in Commerce (with special reference to Accounting) under Plant at LSE.
- 58. The Accountant, 3 May 1952, p. 476.
- 59. The Accountant, 14 June 1952, p. 635.
- 60. It is not known who was in charge of arrangements, but it seems likely to have been Arthur Lionel Morell, a practitioner who was a part-time lecturer at the University. He was then the only Association member from Nottingham.
- 61. The Accountant, 16 April 1955, p. 443.
- 62. The Accountant, 6 April 1957, p. 410.
- 63. Minutes of a Meeting of the Committee of AUTA held at Derby Hall, Liverpool on 30 March 1957.
- 64. Ibid.
- 65. The Accountant, 19 November 1955, pp. 589-590.
- 66. The Accountant, 22 December 1956, pp. 637-639 and 660-664.
- 67. Minutes of a Meeting of the Committee of AUTA held at Derby Hall, Liverpool on 30 March 1957.
- 68. Letter to the author from B. S. Yamey, dated 12 October 1995.
- 69. Minutes of the AAA executive committee meeting, held in Urbana, Illinois, 30/31 August 1954, p. 3, and Minutes of the AAA executive committee meeting, held in Austin, Texas, 4/5 December 1954, p. 4 (supplied by the AAA office in Sarasota, Florida).
- 70. Minutes of a committee meeting held at the London School of Economics on 17 December 1957.
- 71. At p. 299. This was the first reference in *The Accountant* to the affairs of the Association since 1955. The next such reference did not appear until 1971.
- 72. Accounting Education was the proceedings booklet from the 1958 conference which was printed but never officially distributed, for the reason given below.
- 73. Edey, who had joined LSE as a lecturer in 1949, was made a reader in 1955 upon Solomons' departure for the new chair at Bristol. In 1962, LSE awarded Edey a personal chair.
- Minutes of a General Meeting of the Association held in the London School of Economics on 29 March 1958.
- 75. See the announcement that Accounting Research will henceforth 'be incorporated with Accountancy, the monthly journal of The Institute' (The Accountant, 15 November 1958, p. 607), and the letter from Louis Goldberg in which he 'deplore[d] the circumstances, whatever they may have been, that made such a decision necessary' (The Accountant, 13 December 1958, p. 737).
- 76. After Solomons' successive invitations to two members of the ICAEW's Council were declined by each man owing to a concern that any views he would express might be taken as authoritative opinions of the Council and therefore of the Institute, Solomons approached the Vice-President of the Institute for the name of a leading English Chartered Accountant who might be willing to participate. Coulson, who was not a member of the Council, was recommended, and he accepted.

#### S. A. ZEFF

- 77. Letter from Solomons to Coulson, dated 1 December 1958 (in the Solomons files).
- 78. On 23 December 1958, Coulson sent Solomons a six-page memorandum, with a copy to the Institute, in which he set out his criticisms of the proceedings report. Coulson's feelings toward Solomons were summed up by the following passage: 'In particular, the report, certainly in the first session [which Solomons chaired], fails to reflect adequately the provocative and partial tone of much of the comment of the Chairman, as a result of which the level of discussion was not improved and many of the recorded utterances of the speakers were phrased in terms which would better not have been reported' (in the Solomons files). Coulson also alleged that Solomons had been partial in the editing of the proceedings. Solomons conceded none of these points, but largely confined his replies to the matters of detail that could be handled in an addendum.
- 79. Most of the transcript from the second of the three panel sessions, although reflecting a number of differences from the text in *Accounting Education* (1958), was printed in the April and May 1958 issues of *Accountancy*, at pp. 175–178 and 229–232, respectively.
- 80. The Accountant, 16 August 1958, p. 205.
- 81. A summary of most of the important points in the report was published in Lorig (1960, pp. 459–461).
- 82. Letter from Roy Sidebotham, Hon. Secretary, to W. E. Parker Esq., dated 2 December 1959.
- 83. Writing from the United States, Solomons published a scathing critique of the Parker Committee Report (Solomons, 1961).
- 84. In Table 1 of his paper in this special issue, Parker (1997) reports the names of 21 fulltime accounting academics in UK universities in 1960.
- 85. Letter to the author from Cornwell, dated 14 September 1995.
- 86. The Accountant, 8 April 1971, p. 468.
- 87. The Accountant, 12 April 1973, p. 519. In fact, it was the 26th year.
- 88. The Accountant, 18 December 1965, p. 824, and 22 January 1966, p. 120.

#### REFERENCES

- Accounting Education, A Report of a Conference of the Association of University Teachers of Accounting held in London, March (1958). London, Sweet & Maxwell for the Association.
- Arnold, J. & Scapens, R. (1981). 'The British contribution to opportunity cost theory'. In M. Bromwich & A. Hopwood (eds), *Essays in British Accounting Research*, pp. 155–173, London, Pitman.
- Baxter, W.T. (1948). 'Accounting as an academic study', *The Accountant*, 6 March, pp. 181-185.
- Baxter, W.T. (1950). Studies in Accounting, London, Sweet & Maxwell.
- Baxter, W.T. (1978). Collected Papers on Accounting, New York, Arno Press.
- Baxter, W.T. (1991). 'Early critics of costing: LSE in the 1930s'. In O.F. Graves (ed), The Costing Heritage: Studies in Honor of S. Paul Garner, pp. 138–149, Harrisonburg, Virginia, The Academy of Accounting Historians.
- Bircher, P. (1991). From the Companies Act of 1929 to the Companies Act of 1948: A Study of Change in the Law and Practice of Accounting, New York, Garland.
- Bonbright, J.C. (1937). The Valuation of Property: A Treatise on the Appraisal of Property for Different Legal Purposes, New York, McGraw-Hill Book Company.
- Bray, F.S. (1949). 'The English universities and the accounting profession', *The Accounting Review*, July, pp. 273–276.
- Brief, R.P. (ed.) (1980). Dicksee's Contribution to Accounting Theory and Practice, New York, Arno Press.

36

- Canning, J.B. (1929). The Economics of Accountancy: A Critical Analysis of Accounting Theory, New York, The Ronald Press Company.
- Carr-Saunders, A.M. & Wilson, P.A. (1933). The Professions, Oxford, The Clarendon Press.
- Coase, R.H. (1982). 'Economics at LSE in the 1930's: A personal view', Atlantic Economic Journal, March, pp. 31-34.
- Coase, R.H. (1990). 'Accounting and the theory of the firm', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, January, pp. 3-13.
- Craner, J. & Jones, R. (1995). The First Fifty Years of the Professors of Accounting at The University of Birmingham, Birmingham, Birmingham Business School.
- Craner, J. & Jones, R. (1996). 'The First Four Professors of Accounting at The University of Birmingham', Working Paper, University of Birmingham.
- Dawson, S.S. (1898). The Accountant's Compendium, London, Gee and Co.
- De Paula, F.R.M. (1943). 'The future of the accountancy profession', *The Accountant*, 8 May, pp. 239–242.
- Dev, S. (1980). Accounting and the L.S.E. Tradition, London, The London School of Economics and Political Science.
- Dicksee, L.R. (1892). Auditing: A Practical Manual for Auditors, London, Gee and Co.
- Edey, H.C. (1974). 'The Department of Accounting', LSE, June, pp. 1–3.
- Edwards, J.R. (1989). A History of Financial Accounting, London, Routledge.
- Edwards, R.S. (1938). 'The nature and measurement of income', *The Accountant*, 2 July-24 September (reprinted in Parker & Zeff).
- Fanning, R. (1984). 'Economists and Governments: Ireland 1922–52'. In: A.E. Murphy (ed.), Economists and the Irish Economy from the Eighteenth Century to the Present Day, pp. 138–156, Dublin, Irish Academic Press.
- Flint, D. (1978). 'Fifty years of accountancy in the University of Glasgow 1926–1976', Financial Reporting and Accounting Standards, University of Glasgow Press, pp. 1–5.
- Garrett, A.A. (1961). History of The Society of Incorporated Accountants 1885-1957, London, Oxford.
- Goldberg, L. (1987). Dynamics of an Entity: The History of the Accounting Association of Australia and New Zealand, Accounting Association of Australia and New Zealand.
- Gould, J.R. (1974). 'Opportunity cost: the London tradition'. In H. Edey & B.S. Yamey (eds), *Debits, Credits, Finance and Profits*, pp. 91-107, London, Sweet & Maxwell.
- Hatfield, H.R. (1927). Accounting-Its Principles and Problems, New York, D. Appleton and Company.
- Howitt, Sir Harold (1966). The History of The Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales 1880–1965 and of Its Founder Accountancy Bodies 1870–1880, London, The Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales.
- A History of The Chartered Accountants of Scotland From the Earliest Times to 1954 (1954), Edinburgh, The Institute of Chartered Accountants of Scotland.
- "The Japan Accounting Association" (1993). Japanese Accounting Forum (annual publication of the Japan Accounting Association), pp. 3–9.
- Kitchen, J. (1978). Accounting: A Century of Development, University of Hull.
- Kitchen, J. & Parker, R.H. (1980). Accounting Thought and Education: Six English Pioneers, London, The Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales.
- Lee, T.A. (1983). Professors of Accounting at the University of Edinburgh—A Selection of Writings 1919–1983, Department of Accounting and Business Method, University of Edinburgh.
- Lee, T.A. (1996). 'Richard Brown, Chartered Accountant and Christian Gentleman'. In T.A. Lee (ed.), Shaping the Accountancy Profession: The Story of Three Scottish Pioneers, pp. 153–221, New York, Garland.
- Littleton, A.C. & Yamey, B.S. (1956). Studies in the History of Accounting, London, Sweet & Maxwell, and Homewood, Illinois, Richard D. Irwin.
- Lockwood, J. (1938). 'Early university education in accountancy', The Accounting Review, June, pp. 131–144.

#### S. A. ZEFF

- Lorig, A.N. (1960). 'Training accountants in Great Britain', *The Accounting Review*, July, pp. 455-463.
- Mumford, M.J. (1991). 'Chartered accountants as business managers: an oral history perspective', Accounting, Business & Financial History, March, pp. 123-140.
- Napier, C.J. (1996a). 'Academic disdain? Economists and accounting in Britain, 1850–1950'. Accounting, Business & Financial History, 6, pp. 427–450.
- Napier, C.J. (1996b). 'Accounting and the absence of a business economics tradition in the United Kingdom', *The European Accounting Review*, 5, pp. 449–481.
- Norris, H. (1946). Accounting Theory: An Outline of Its Structure, London, Sir Isaac Pitman & Sons.
- Parker, R.H. (1997). 'Flickering at the margin of existence: the Association of University Teachers of Accounting, 1960–1971', The British Accounting Review, March, pp. 41–61.
- Parker, R.H. & Zeff, S.A. (1996). *Milestones in the British Accounting Literature*, New York, Garland.
- Parker, W.E. (1957). 'Training for the profession-II', The Accountant, 3 August, pp. 122-127.
- Paton, W.A. & Littleton, A.C. (1940) An Introduction to Corporate Accounting Standards, American Accounting Association.
- Report of the Committee on Education and Training ('The Parker Committee Report') (1961). London, The Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales.
- Rowland, S.W. (1939*a*). 'New movements in accountancy', *The Accountant*, 28 January, pp. 131–132.
- Rowland, S.W. (1939b). 'Experience, research and speculation in accounting', The Accountant, 1 April, pp. 442-444.
- Shackleton, K. (1992). 'The evolution of education policy within the Institute of Chartered Accountants of Scotland'. In K. Anyane-Ntow (ed.), *International Handbook of Accounting Education and Certification*, pp. 417–444, Oxford, Pergamon Press.
- Solomons, D. (1951). 'The universities and the accountancy profession', *The Accountants Journal*, February, pp. 40–43.
- Solomons, D. (1952). Studies in Costing, London, Sweet & Maxwell.
- Solomons, D. (1956). 'Accounting education for new responsibilities', *The Accountant*, 28 January, pp. 83–86; 4 February, pp. 114–120.
- Solomons, D. (1961). 'The report on education and training: failure of a mission', Accountancy, July, pp. 407-412 (reprinted in Parker & Zeff).
- Solomons, D. (1984). Collected Papers on Accounting and Accounting Education, New York, Garland (2 vols).
- Solomons, D. & Zeff, S.A. (1996). Accounting Research, 1948–1958, New York, Garland (2 vols).
- Solomons, D. & Berridge, T.M. (1974). Prospectus for a Profession, London, Advisory Board of Accountancy Education.
- Some Accounting Terms and Concepts, A Report of a Joint Exploratory Committee appointed by The Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales and by the National Institute of Economic and Social Research (1951). Cambridge, The University Press.
- Stacey, N.A.H. (1954). English Accountancy: A Study in Social and Economic History 1800– 1954, London, Gee and Company.
- Stamp, Sir J. (1921). 'The relation of accountancy to economics', *The Accountant*, 15 October, pp. 501–507 (reprinted in Parker & Zeff).
- Tress, R.C. (1952). 'The use of accountancy terms and concepts by economists', *Accounting Research*, October, pp. 317–331.
- Walker, S.P. (1988). The Society of Accountants in Edinburgh 1854–1914: A Study of Recruitment to a New Profession, New York, Garland.
- Walker, S.P. (1994). Accountancy at the University of Edinburgh 1919-1994: The Emergence of a 'Viable Academic Department', Edinburgh, The Institute of Chartered Accountants of Scotland.

- Zeff, S.A. (1966). The American Accounting Association-Its First 50 Years, American Accounting Association (reprinted in 1991 by the AAA).
- Zeff, S.A. (1972). Forging Accounting Principles in Five Countries: A History and an Analysis of Trends, Champaign, Illinois, Stipes.
- Zeff, S.A. (1995). David Solomons (1912–1995)—An Appreciation', Accounting and Business Research, Autumn, pp. 315–319.